New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes

Date: May 5, 2021

Location: Zoom Teleconference

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Commissioners absent: Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene

I. Minutes of the April 7, 2021 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes. By: Lee Bressler Second: Calvin Alexander Result: Passed In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed: Comments:

II. Landmark nomination of 2425 – 2427 First St.

Motion: Nominate 2425-2427 First St. for study as a Landmark. By: Jennie West Second: Annie Cambria Second: Jason King Result: Passed Comments:

III. Landmark nomination of 2421 – 2423 First St.

Motion: Nominate 2421-2423 First St. for study as a Landmark. By: Calvin Alexander Second: Ayo Love Second: Donna Wakeman Result: Passed Comments:

IV. Landmark nomination of 2309 - 2311 Second St.

Motion: Nominate 2309-2311 Second St. for study as a Landmark. By: Heather Szapary Second: Calvin Alexander Second: Stephanie Bruno Result: Passed Comments:

V. Landmark nomination of 2005 – 2007 Rev John Raphael Jr Way Motion: Nominate 2005-2007 Rev. John Raphael Jr. Way for study as a Landmark.

By: Donna Wakeman Second: Jennie West Second: Calvin Alexander Result: Passed Comments:

VI. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda By: Calvin Alexander Second: Stephanie Bruno Result: Passed In favor: Ed de Montluzin, , Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed: Comments: Jennie West and Greg Hackenberg recused themselves.

VII. New Business Work Applications

A. 1617-19 Coliseum St

Application: Replace existing slate roof with new standing seam metal roof on a contributing, two-story, single-family residential building. Motion: Approve the application. By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Donna Wakeman Result: Passed In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed: Comments:

B. <u>928 Euterpe St</u>

Application: Installation of solar panels at a significant rated, one-story, single-family residential building residential building.

Motion: Approve the application, with the proviso that the panels are unobtrusive and in a rectangular array.

By: Emilie Bahr Second: Annie Cambria Result: Motion withdrawn. In favor: Opposed:

Comments: Several Commissioners were concerned with approving solar panels on a Significant-rated building that are visible from the public right-of-way.

Motion: Approve the application, as long as the panels meet the Guidelines and staff is comfortable with the updated array. By: Emilie Bahr Second: Stephanie Bruno Result: Passed In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed: Comments:

C. 1137 St Charles Ave

Application: Appeal of ARC recommendations regarding proposed window replacement and new rear addition.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission hearing to allow the applicant to meet with the Architectural Review Committee again and try to resolve these issues.

By: Jennie West

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King

Opposed:

Comments: The Commission requested that the applicant should provide three-dimensional renderings of the rear elevation to the ARC to better illustrate the visibility of the various components with and without screening.

D. 5504 St Charles Ave

Application: New construction of a 580 SF garage accessory structure and replacement of existing historic fencing with new metal fencing.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval of the garage structure with the details to be worked out at the Staff level and approve the request to remove and replace the existing perimeter fencing with the proviso that the CofA will not be issued until the ARC reviews and approves the final fence details.

By: Ed deMontluzin

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed: Comments:

VIII. New Business Demolition Applications

A. 5621 Royal St

Application: Demolition of a non-contributing one-story, single-family residential building to grade. Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.

By: Calvin Alexander

Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed:

Comments:

B. 8515 Freret St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof and the wall area of a contributing, one-story, single-family residential building for an addition.

Motion: Deny the application for partial roof and wall demolition.

By: Jennie West

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King

Opposed: Comments:

C. 4707 Magazine St

Application: Demolition of a non-contributing one-story commercial building to grade.
Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.
By: Greg Hackenberg
Second: Ed deMontluzin
Result: Passed
In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King
Opposed:
Comments:

D. 4713 Magazine St

Application: Demolition of a contributing one-story commercial building to grade.
Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.
By: Ed deMontluzin
Second: Lee Bressler
Result: Passed
In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King
Opposed:
Comments:

E. 722 S Salcedo St

Application: Demolition of a contributing, one-story, two-family residential building to grade. Motion: Deny the application for demolition. By: Annie Cambria Second: Stephanie Bruno Result: Passed In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed: Comments:

F. <u>420-22 S Galvez St</u>

Application: Demolition of a raised-basement, multi-family residential building to grade and the demolition of the rear accessory building. Motion: Deny the request for demolition of the main structure and approve the request for demolition of the accessory structure. By: Annie Cambria Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed: Comments:

G. <u>8816 Apple St</u>

Application: Demolition of a contributing, two-story, single-family residential building to grade. Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade. By: Lee Bressler Second: Annie Cambria Result: Passed In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Unanimous Opposed: Comments:

H. 2120-22 Louisiana Ave

Application: Demolition of a contributing one-story, raised-basement two-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition.

By: Calvin Alexander

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed:

Comments:

I. 2300-02 Annunciation St

Application: Demolition of a contributing, one-story, single-family residential building to grade. Motion: Deny the application for demolition.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Heather Szapary Result: Passed In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed: Comments:

J. 736 General Taylor St

Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade and more than 50% of the roof structure of an existing contributing one-story, single-family residential building for a renovation and camelback addition.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof and facade demolition.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed: Comments:

IX. Old Business Retention Applications

A. 435 Bouny St

Application: Retention of removal of historic brick chimneys.

Motion: Deny the application for retention of the removal of the two front chimneys. The applicant may reconstruct the chimneys to match the original condition or construct new faux chimneys to match the appearance of the original chimneys, with final details to be submitted to Staff for approval. By: Heather Szapary Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed In favor: Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jason King Opposed: Emilie Bahr Comments:

X. New Business Retention Applications

A. <u>1132-34 St Andrew St</u>

Application: Retention of inappropriate balcony handrails in deviation of a CofA. Motion: Deny By: Donna Wakeman Second: Heather Szapary Result: Passed In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed: Comments:

XI. Ratification of Architectural Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, April 7, 2021 Meeting.

Motion: Ratify the actions of the Architectural Review Committee and Staff since the Wednesday, April 7th meeting. By: Calvin Alexander Second: Greg Hackenberg Result: Passed In favor: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Emilie Bahr, Jason King Opposed: Comments: